arXiv:1603.08420v1 [math.NT] 26 Feb 2016

On a sum of positive rational numbers whose product is 1

Jungin Lee

Abstract. In this note, we prove that for every two positive integers $m \geq n \geq 9$, there exist n positive rational numbers whose product is 1 and sum is m.

Keywords : Diophantine equation, Legendre's three square theorem

AMS Subject Classification : 11D68

1 Introduction

Bondarenko [1] proved that for every two positive integers $m \geq n \geq 12$, there exist n positive rational numbers whose product is 1 and sum is m. The key point of the proof in [1] is Lagrange's four square theorem. In this note, we will improve this result to $m \geq n \geq 9$ by using Legendre's three square theorem. Also we will show that for every positive integer $5 \leq m \leq 100$, there exist 5 positive rational numbers whose product is 1 and sum is m.

2 Results

Lemma 2.1. *([1], Lemma 1) For every $m > 0$, there exist $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Q}_{>0}$ such that $a+b+c = m$ and $abc = 1$ if and only if $x^3 + y^3 + z^3 = mxyz$ has a solution in positive integers.*

Let A_n ($n \in \mathbb{N}$) be $\{s \in \mathbb{N} \mid \exists a_1, \cdots, a_n \in \mathbb{Q}_{>0} \ \prod_{i=1}^{n} a_i = 1, \sum_{i=1}^{n} a_i = s\}$. Then $n \in A_n$ for every $n \in \mathbb{N}$, and $2 + \frac{1}{2} + 2 + \frac{1}{2} = 5$ implies $5 \in A_4$. From the table 3 of [2] and Lemma 2.1, $5, 6, 10, 14, 30 \in A_3$. Denote $[n]^r$ if $r \in A_n$. It is easy to see that $r_1 \in A_{n_1}$ and $r_2 \in A_{n_2}$ imply $r_1 + r_2 \in A_{n_1+n_2}$, so we can define $[n_1]^{r_1} + [n_2]^{r_2} = [n_1 + n_2]^{r_1+r_2}$.

Theorem 2.2. *For every positive integer $n \geq 9$, $A_n = \{k \in \mathbb{N} \mid k \geq n\}$.*

n	$[n]^9$	n	$[n]^9$
9	$[9]^9$	22	$[14]^3+[5]^3+[3]^3$
10	$[5]^4+[5]^5$	30	$[10]^3+[10]^3+[10]^3$
11	$[5]^3+[6]^6$	38	$[30]^3+[5]^3+[3]^3$
12	$[6]^3+[6]^6$	43	$[30]^3+[10]^3+[3]^3$
13	$[6]^3+[5]^4+[2]^2$	46	$[30]^3+[10]^3+[6]^3$
14	$[6]^3+[5]^3+[3]^3$		

Table 1: remaining cases

Proof. Suppose that $A_9 = \{k \in \mathbb{N} \mid k \geq 9\}$. Then for every $m \geq n \geq 9$, there exist 9 positive rational numbers $b_1, \cdots, b_9$ whose product is 1 and sum is $m-n+9$. In this case,

$$a_k = \begin{cases} b_k \ (1 \leq k \leq 9) \\ 1 \ (9 < k \leq n) \end{cases}$$

satisfies $a_1 \cdots a_n = 1$ and $a_1 + \cdots + a_n = m$, so $A_n = \{k \in \mathbb{N} \mid k \geq n\}$ for every $n \geq 9$. Thus it is enough to show that $A_9 = \{k \in \mathbb{N} \mid k \geq 9\}$.

For every non-negative integer a, $\{x, y, z, m\} = \left\{2,\ a^2+a+1,\ a^2-a+1,\ a^2+5\right\}$ and $\left\{\frac{a^2+147}{4},\ \frac{a^4+6a^3+36a^2+98a+147}{16},\ \frac{a^4-6a^3+36a^2-98a+147}{16},\ \frac{a^2+33}{2}\right\}$ are solutions of the equation $x^3+y^3+z^3 = mxyz$. (These solutions are on the page 205 and 210 of [3] as an example, respectively.) $a^4-6a^3+36a^2-98a+147 = (a^2-3a)^2+27(a-2)^2+(10a+39) > 0$ for every non-negative integer a, so Lemma 2.1 implies that there exist $p_i, q_i, r_i \in \mathbb{Q}_{>0}$ $(i = 1, 2)$ such that $p_1q_1r_1 = p_2q_2r_2 = 1$, $p_1+q_1+r_1 = a^2+5$ and $p_2+q_2+r_2 = \frac{a^2+33}{2}$. (If $x^3+y^3+z^3 = mxyz$ has a solution in positive rational numbers, then it has a solution in positive integers.)

Thus for every non-negative integers a, b and c, there exist $a_1, \cdots, a_9, b_1, \cdots b_9 \in \mathbb{Q}_{>0}$ such that $a_1 \cdots a_9 = b_1 \cdots b_9 = 1$, $a_1 + \cdots + a_9 = (a^2+5)+(b^2+5)+(c^2+5) = a^2+b^2+c^2+15$ and $b_1 + \cdots + b_9 = \frac{a^2+33}{2} + \frac{b^2+33}{2} + \frac{c^2+33}{2} = \frac{a^2+b^2+c^2+99}{2}$.

Suppose that a positive integer $m \geq 50$ cannot be represented of the forms $a^2+b^2+c^2+15$ or $\frac{a^2+b^2+c^2+99}{2}$. Then by Legendre's three square theorem, both of $m-15$ and $2m-99$ are of the form $4^k(8t+7)$ $(k, t \geq 0)$. $2m-99$ is odd, so $2m-99 \equiv 7 \pmod 8$ and this implies $m-15 \equiv 2 \pmod 4$, a contradiction.

If a positive integer $15 \leq m \leq 49$ cannot be represented of the form $a^2+b^2+c^2+15$, then $m-15 = 4^k(8t+7)$ for some $k, t \geq 0$. Thus $m-15 \in \{7, 15, 23, 31, 28\}$. Now the only remaining cases are $9 \leq m \leq 14$ and $m \in \{22, 30, 38, 43, 46\}$. Table 1 shows that if $9 \leq m \leq 14$ or $m \in \{22, 30, 38, 43, 46\}$, then $m \in A_9$. □

n	$(b_1, b_2, b_3, b_4, b_5)$	n	$(b_1, b_2, b_3, b_4, b_5)$	n	$(b_1, b_2, b_3, b_4, b_5)$
9	$(1, 2, 4, 18, 3)$	60	$(1, 28, 4, 126, 3)$	84	$(1, 72, 66, 4, 44)$
17	$(1, 2, 25, 45, 30)$	61	$(1, 18, 14, 3, 126)$	86	$(1, 48, 4, 150, 60)$
25	$(1, 3, 5, 100, 30)$	65	$(1, 2, 116, 18, 87)$	87	$(1, 20, 3, 200, 30)$
33	$(1, 4, 108, 150, 90)$	66	$(1, 2, 126, 48, 28)$	88	$(1, 25, 2, 125, 50)$
35	$(1, 2, 56, 18, 84)$	67	$(1, 38, 12, 2, 57)$	89	$(1, 60, 34, 3, 85)$
41	$(1, 3, 108, 150, 90)$	70	$(1, 2, 132, 18, 33)$	90	$(1, 75, 10, 147, 14)$
45	$(1, 3, 4, 162, 9)$	73	$(1, 7, 3, 196, 42)$	93	$(1, 2, 180, 12, 10)$
47	$(1, 3, 128, 144, 6)$	75	$(1, 32, 4, 169, 104)$	95	$(1, 42, 15, 2, 105)$
49	$(1, 3, 25, 4, 150)$	79	$(1, 17, 90, 3, 170)$	96	$(1, 63, 6, 196, 42)$
54	$(1, 2, 100, 180, 6)$	80	$(1, 6, 2, 147, 14)$	97	$(1, 80, 12, 200, 30)$
57	$(1, 3, 160, 24, 10)$	81	$(1, 45, 156, 4, 130)$	100	$(1, 78, 9, 192, 104)$
59	$(1, 3, 160, 24, 60)$	82	$(1, 35, 3, 140, 30)$		

Table 2: solution of $\frac{b_2}{b_1} + \frac{b_3}{b_2} + \frac{b_4}{b_3} + \frac{b_5}{b_4} + \frac{b_1}{b_5} = n$ $(n \leq 100)$

It is easy to see that $n \in A_4$ implies $n + 1 \in A_5$. The list of elements of A_4 up to 100 (possibly not complete) is given in 9.9.2 of [4]. From this, we obtain that if a positive integer $5 \leq n \leq 100$ satisfies $n \notin A_5$, then n is one of the $9, 17, 25, 33, 35, 41, 45, 47, 49, 54, 57, 59, 60, 61, 65, 66, 67, 70, 73, 75, 79, 80, 81, 82, 84, 86, 87, 88, 89, 90, 93, 95, 96, 97$ or 100. Table 2 shows that all of these integers are elements of A_5. Thus every positive integer $5 \leq n \leq 100$ is an element of A_5. This result supports the following conjecture.

Conjecture 2.3. *For every positive integer $n \geq 5$, $A_n = \{k \in \mathbb{N} \mid k \geq n\}$.*

Bondarenko ([1], Theorem 3) proved that if $m = 4k^2$ $(k \in \mathbb{N})$ and k is not divisible by 3, then $m \notin A_3$. We check that $\frac{b_2}{b_1} + \frac{b_3}{b_2} + \frac{b_4}{b_3} + \frac{b_1}{b_4} = 8$ does not have a solution where b_i $(1 \leq i \leq 4)$ are positive integers and $1 \leq b_1 \leq 200, 1 \leq b_2, b_3, b_4 \leq 1000$. From this numerical evidence, we make the following conjecture.

Conjecture 2.4. *There exists a positive integer $k \geq 4$ such that $k \notin A_4$. In particular, $8 \notin A_4$.*

Acknowledgments The author would like to thank the anonymous referee for their helpful comments. The author also thanks Minryoung Kim who find solutions of the equation $\frac{b_2}{b_1} + \frac{b_3}{b_2} + \frac{b_4}{b_3} + \frac{b_5}{b_4} + \frac{b_1}{b_5} = n$ for some positive integers $n \leq 100$.

3 References

1. A. V. Bondarenko, Investigation of one class of Diophantine equations, Ukrainian Math. J. 52(6) (2000) 953-959.

2. E. Dofs, On some classes of homogeneous ternary cubic Diophantine equations, Ark. Mat. 13(1) (1975) 29-72.

3. E. Dofs, Solutions of $x^3 + y^3 + z^3 = nxyz$, Acta Arith. 73(3) (1995) 201-213.

4. A. Nowicki, Liczby Wymierne, Podróże po Imperium Liczb, cz.1, Wydanie drugie. Wydawnictwo OWSIiZ, Torun, Olsztyń, 2012.

Department of Mathematical Sciences, Seoul National University, Seoul 151-747, Korea
e-mail: moleculesum@snu.ac.kr